

Dena C. Sharp (State Bar No. 245869)  
 Jordan Elias (State Bar No. 228731)  
 Adam E. Polk (State Bar No. 273000)  
 Scott M. Grzenczyk (State Bar No. 279309)  
**GIRARD SHARP LLP**  
 601 California Street, Suite 1400  
 San Francisco, CA 94108  
 Tel: (415) 981-4800  
 Fax: (415) 981-4846  
 dsharp@girardsharp.com  
 jeliass@girardsharp.com  
 apolk@girardsharp.com  
 scottg@girardsharp.com  
*Attorneys for Advertiser Plaintiffs*

Justina K. Sessions (State Bar No. 270914)  
**WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI**  
 Professional Corporation  
 One Market Plaza  
 Spear Tower, Suite 3300  
 San Francisco, California 94105  
 Telephone: (415) 947-2197  
 Facsimile: (415) 947-2099  
 Email: jsessions@wsgr.com  
*Counsel for Defendants Google LLC,  
 Alphabet Inc., and YouTube, LLC*

Eric L. Cramer\*  
 Caitlin G. Coslett\*  
**BERGER MONTAGUE PC**  
 1818 Market Street, Suite 3600  
 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
 Tel: (215) 875-3000  
 Fax: (215) 875-4604  
 ecramer@bm.net  
 ccoslett@bm.net  
*Attorneys for Publisher Plaintiffs*

[Additional Counsel Listed on Signature Page]

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
 SAN JOSE DIVISION**

IN RE GOOGLE DIGITAL  
 ADVERTISING ANTITRUST  
 LITIGATION

Case No. 5:20-cv-03556-BLF

IN RE GOOGLE DIGITAL  
 PUBLISHER ANTITRUST  
 LITIGATION

Case No. 5:20-cv-08984-BLF

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED EXPERT  
 PROTOCOL**

Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 29, the parties, through their respective counsel of record, stipulate to the following order (the “Order”) regarding the scope of expert discovery in the above-captioned matters and all other matters subsequently consolidated with them (collectively, the “Actions”), subject to approval by the Court:

### **I. GENERAL PROVISIONS**

This Order applies to all parties to the Actions. This Order provides the protocols applicable to conducting discovery relating to expert witnesses. Nothing in this Order shall preclude any party from seeking to modify it later for good cause; prior to doing so, however, counsel of record shall meet and confer among themselves in a good-faith effort to reach agreement as to the appropriate scope of any modifications or revisions to this Order.

No subpoenas (for depositions or documents) need be served on any testifying expert from whom a report or declaration is provided. Instead, the party proffering such expert will (a) be responsible for producing all materials and information relied on by the expert, and (b) make the expert available for deposition at a time mutually agreed to by the parties and consistent with the Court’s scheduling orders.

### **II. GOVERNING LAW**

Expert discovery shall be governed by the applicable provisions of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, except as otherwise provided herein or in any other order in these Actions. Unless modified herein, nothing in this Order shall be construed to abrogate, modify, or enlarge the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

### **III. DISCOVERY RELATING TO EXPERTS**

#### **A. Expert-Related Materials To Be Disclosed**

1. Within three (3) business days of the service of any expert report or expert declaration pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure Rule 26(a)(2)(B) or otherwise, the party or parties proffering the expert shall produce:

- 1 a. a copy of the data or other information referred to therein or relied upon by the expert  
2 as a basis for the expert's opinions (to the extent not already produced in discovery),  
3 including, but not limited to, underlying data, spreadsheets (including formulas  
4 therein), computerized regression analysis and/or other underlying reports, programs,  
5 computer codes and schedules sufficient to reconstruct the work, calculations, and/or  
6 analyses upon which the expert witness is relying for their opinions;<sup>1</sup> and  
7 b. exhibits, information, or data processed or modeled by a computer at the direction of  
8 an expert, to the extent relied upon as a basis for the expert's opinions.
- 9 2. The information required by paragraph III.A.1 above shall be produced electronically (via  
10 email or FTP site) where feasible. Data, statistical analyses, or other information (including  
11 any calculation or exhibit) upon which an expert relies for any of their opinion(s) in this  
12 matter shall be provided in machine readable format, including any data that has been  
13 cleaned, reformatted, or modified in any way from the form in which it may have been  
14 provided to the expert. To the extent the disclosures in an expert report include, rely upon, or  
15 describe exhibits, information, or data processed or modeled by a computer at the direction of  
16 an expert in the course of and to the extent of such expert's reliance on such material for the  
17 expert's opinions, the party offering the expert's opinions must produce native copies of the  
18 data along with the appropriate instructions.
- 19 3. No party need produce programs, software, or instructions that are commercially available at  
20 a reasonable cost, as long as the party offering the expert's opinion provides timely and  
21 reasonable access for purposes of replication or analysis of disclosed results.

22  
23  
24 <sup>1</sup> Notwithstanding the obligation to disclose documents, data, or other information "relied" on by the  
25 expert witness, documents, data, or other information that is merely "considered by" the expert witness  
does not need to be disclosed.

4. Documents that are publicly available need not be produced absent specific request, provided that they are identified with sufficient specificity to allow the opposing side to locate and obtain the document.
5. Documents that have previously been produced during discovery in these Actions need not be produced if they are identified by Bates number.
6. Paragraphs III.A.1-2 above are not intended to limit the ability of any party to prepare and use demonstrative exhibits, including demonstrative exhibits that may relate to an expert's testimony, during the course of any deposition, hearing, or trial. The admissibility of any such demonstrative exhibits shall be governed by the Federal Rules of Evidence, the Rules of Civil Procedure, and this Court's Local Rules, unless otherwise provided by order of the Court.

**B. Expert Materials Not Requiring Disclosure**

1. Notwithstanding the foregoing and the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the following materials shall not be subject to discovery or disclosure by any method (including by deposition):
  - a. the content of communications among and between: (i) counsel and the expert and/or the expert's staff and/or supporting firms; (ii) counsel and any non-testifying expert consultant and/or the consultant's staff; (iii) the expert and other experts and/or other non-testifying expert consultants; (iv) experts and their staff and/or supporting firms; (v) non-testifying expert consultants and their staffs; (vi) any expert or non-testifying expert consultant and the staff or supporting firm of any other expert or non-testifying expert; or (vii) the respective staffs and/or supporting firms of experts or non-testifying expert consultants and the staffs and/or supporting firms of other experts or non-testifying expert consultants;

- b. notes, drafts, written communications, or other records of preliminary work created by, or for, experts or non-testifying expert consultants;
    - c. drafts of: expert reports, affidavits, declarations, or other expert materials, including, without limitation, draft studies, analyses, opinions, or written expert testimony; draft expert work papers prepared in connection with the litigation; preliminary or intermediate calculations, computations, modeling, or data runs prepared in connection with the litigation; or other preliminary expert opinions or any communication between an expert and their staff, assistants, or agents and any other expert retained by the party, including their staff, assistants, or agents; draft materials prepared by, for, or at the direction of an expert witness; and
    - d. any comments, whether oral or written, related to a report, affidavit or declaration or draft report, affidavit, or declaration of an expert witness prepared in connection with the litigation by (i) counsel for a party retaining the expert witness, (ii) an expert consultant, (iii) any person working at the direction of an expert witness, (iv) any other expert witness, (v) any other expert consultant, or (vi) any person working at the direction of another expert witness or expert consultant—except to the extent such comments were relied upon by the expert as a basis for the expert’s opinions;
    - e. budgets, invoices, bills, receipts, or time records concerning testifying or non-testifying expert witnesses or consultants, their staff, assistants, colleagues, or associates, or their companies or organizations; and
  2. The parties are not required to produce or exchange logs reflecting any of the aforementioned items that are not subject to discovery or production pursuant to this Order.
  3. The foregoing exclusions from expert discovery will not apply to any information, communications, or documents upon which the expert relies as a basis for their opinion. All

information, communications, or documents upon which the expert relies as a basis for their opinion are discoverable.

4. Nothing herein relieves an expert or party of the duty to identify the facts, data, and assumptions that the expert relied upon as a basis for their opinions.

**IT IS SO STIPULATED, through Counsel of Record.**

Dated: June 24, 2021

By: /s/ Caitlin G. Coslett  
Eric L. Cramer\*  
ecramer@bm.net  
Michael C. Dell'Angelo\*  
mdellangelo@bm.net  
Caitlin G. Coslett\*  
ccoslett@bm.net  
Patrick F. Madden\*  
pmadden@bm.net  
BERGER MONTAGUE PC  
1818 Market St., Suite 3600  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Tel.: (215) 875-3000 / Fax: (215) 875-4604  
  
Sophia M. Rios (305801)  
srios@bm.net  
BERGER MONTAGUE PC  
12544 High Bluff Drive, Suite 340  
San Diego, CA 92130  
Tel.: (619) 489-0300 / Fax: (215) 875-4604  
  
Daniel J. Walker\*  
dwalker@bm.net  
BERGER MONTAGUE PC  
2001 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Suite 300  
Washington DC 20006  
Tel.: (202) 559-9745

BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP  
Philip C. Korologos\*  
pkorologos@bsfllp.com  
Brianna S. Hills\*  
bhills@bsfllp.com  
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP  
55 Hudson Yards, 20th Floor  
New York, NY 10001  
Tel.: (212) 446-2300 / Fax: (212) 446-2350

David Boies\*  
dboies@bsfllp.com  
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP  
333 Main Street  
Armonk, NY 10504  
Tel.: (914) 749-8200 / Fax: (914) 749-8300  
Abby L. Dennis\*  
adennis@bsfllp.com  
Jesse Panuccio\*  
jpanuccio@bsfllp.com  
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP  
1401 New York Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20005  
Tel.: (202) 895-7580 / Fax: (202) 237-6131

Mark C. Mao (236165)  
mmao@bsfllp.com  
Sean P. Rodriguez (262437)  
srodriguez@bsfllp.com  
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP  
44 Montgomery Street, 41st Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Tel.: (415) 293-6820 / Fax: (415) 293-6899

Sabria A. McElroy\*  
smcelroy@bsfllp.com  
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP  
401 E. Las Olas Blvd., Suite 1200  
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301  
Tel.: (954) 377 4216 / Fax: (954) 356-0022

Stephen M. Tillery\*  
stillery@koreintillery.com  
Michael E. Klenov (277028)  
mklenov@koreintillery.com  
Carol L. O'Keefe\*  
cokeefe@koreintillery.com  
Jamie Boyer\*  
jboyer@koreintillery.com  
KOREIN TILLERY LLC  
505 North 7th Street, Suite 3600  
St. Louis, MO 63101  
Tel.: (314) 241-4844 / Fax: (314) 241-3525

George A. Zelcs\*  
gzlcs@koreintillery.com  
Robert E. Litan\*  
rlitan@koreintillery.com  
Randall P. Ewing\*  
rewing@koreintillery.com  
Jonathon D. Byrer\*  
jbyrer@koreintillery.com  
Ryan A. Cortazar\*  
rcortazar@koreintillery.com  
Marc A. Wallenstein  
mwallenstein@koreintillery.com  
KOREIN TILLERY LLC  
205 North Michigan Avenue, Suite 1950  
Chicago, IL 60601  
Tel.: (312) 641-9750 / Fax: (312) 641-9751

*Interim Co-Lead Counsel for the Publisher  
Plaintiffs*

Dated: June 24, 2021

By: /s/ Dena C. Sharp  
Dena C. Sharp (State Bar No. 245869)  
Jordan Elias (State Bar No. 228731)  
Scott M. Grzenczyk (State Bar No. 279309)  
GIRARD SHARP LLP  
601 California Street, Suite 1400  
San Francisco, CA 94108  
Tel: (415) 981-4800  
Fax: (415) 981-4846  
dsharp@girardsharp.com  
jelias@girardsharp.com  
scottg@girardsharp.com



Tina Wolfson (State Bar No. 174806)  
Rachel Johnson (State Bar No. 331351)  
Theodore W. Maya (State Bar No. 223242)  
AHDoot & WOLFSON, PC  
2600 West Olive Ave., Suite 500  
Burbank, California 91505  
Tel.: (310) 474-9111  
Fax: (310) 474-8585  
twolfson@ahdootwolfson.com  
rjohnson@ahdootwolfson.com  
tmaya@ahdootwolfson.com

*Interim Co-Lead Counsel for the Advertiser  
Plaintiffs*

Archana Tamoshunas (*pro hac vice*)  
TAUS, CEBULASH & LANDAU, LLP  
80 Maiden Lane, Suite 1204  
New York, NY 10038  
Tel: (212) 931-0704  
Fax: (212) 931-0703  
atamoshunas@tcllaw.com

April Lambert (*pro hac vice*)  
RADICE LAW FIRM, PC  
475 Wall Street  
Princeton, NJ 08540  
Tel: (646) 245-8502  
Fax: (609) 385-0745  
alambert@radicelawfirm.com

*Executive Committee for the Advertiser Plaintiffs*

Dated: June 24, 2021

By: /s/ Justina K. Sessions  
Justina K. Sessions (State Bar No. 270914)  
WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI  
Professional Corporation  
One Market Plaza  
Spear Tower, Suite 3300  
San Francisco, California 94105  
Telephone: (415) 947-2197  
Facsimile: (415) 947-2099  
Email: jsessions@wsgr.com

Jonathan M. Jacobson  
WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI  
1301 Avenue of the Americas, 40<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10019  
Telephone: (212) 497-7758  
Facsimile: (212) 999-5899  
Email: jjacobson@wsgr.com

*Counsel for Defendants Google LLC,  
Alphabet Inc., and YouTube, LLC*

**ATTESTATION**

I, Caitlin G. Coslett, am the ECF User whose ID and password are being used to file the foregoing document in Case No. 5:20-cv-08984-BLF. In compliance with Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), I attest that concurrence in this filing has been obtained from all signatories above.

By: /s/ Caitlin G. Coslett

**ATTESTATION**

I, Dena C. Sharp, am the ECF User whose ID and password are being used to file the foregoing document in Case No. 5:20-cv-03556-BLF. In compliance with Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), I attest that concurrence in this filing has been obtained from all signatories above.

By: /s/ Dena C. Sharp

**[PROPOSED] ORDER**

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Hon. Beth L. Freeman  
United States District Judge